Developing A More Viable Disaster Housing Unit: A Case Study of the Mississippi Alternative Housing Program

February 2, 2009

Prepared by:  
Abt Associates Inc.  
Amy Jones & Associates

Prepared for:  
Department of Housing and Urban Development  
Office of Policy Development & Research  
Federal Emergency Management Agency  
Disaster Assistance Directorate  
Alternative Housing Pilot Program
Acknowledgements

This report was prepared by Abt Associates Inc. for the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) and the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development’s (HUD) Office of Policy Development and Research (PD&R). FEMA established an interagency agreement with HUD to evaluate the Alternative Housing Pilot Program (AHPP). This case study is the first in a series of evaluation reports and reviews the State of Mississippi’s AHPP program from grant start-up in 2007 through August 2008.

The primary authors of this case study are Amy Jones of Amy Jones Associates, Inc. and Erin Wilson of Abt Associates. Dana Bres of PD&R authored Chapter Four, which reviews and summarizes the building sciences evaluation in Mississippi. Larry Buron and Jill Khadduri of Abt Associates provided technical review. The authors are appreciative of the guidance and support provided by Cheryl Levine at HUD and Naomi Johnson at FEMA.

This case study would not have been possible without the willingness of the Mississippi Emergency Management Agency (MEMA) to allow the evaluators access to the inner workings of the Mississippi Alternative Housing Program (MAHP). MEMA’s leadership fostered an open, honest atmosphere that encouraged staff with varying project roles to reflect openly on the challenges, successes and lessons learned. In particular, we thank Mike Womack, MEMA’s Executive Director, and the MAHP project directors, Becky Baum (MEMA), Keith Campbell (MEMA) and Debbie Norton (PBS&J) for giving generously of their time and experience. The authors also appreciate MEMA’s fastidious effort to document program activities and outcomes in order to inform future disaster housing programs.

In addition to MAHP staff, many community leaders and representatives provided valuable context and important perspectives about community needs and the role MAHP is playing in recovery efforts. They gave freely of their time and opinions, despite the heavy demands of the rebuilding effort that continue three years after the storms. Lastly, we thank the MAHP program participants who shared their experiences and thoughts about the program in hopes of contributing to the development of a housing solution that will benefit families in future disasters.
# Table of Contents

## Acknowledgements

## Executive Summary ........................................................... 1
   Introduction ........................................................................................... 1
   Grantee Organization ........................................................................ 2
   MAHP Program Design ........................................................................ 3
   Unit Design, Production and Installation ........................................... 4
   Disposition and Demobilization of Units ............................................ 6
   Observations and Lessons Learned ................................................... 8
   The MAHP Units .................................................................................... 8
   Quality of Life ........................................................................................ 11
   Community Response ........................................................................... 13
   Organizational Capacity and Implementation .................................. 14

## Chapter One: Introduction ............................................. 17
   South Mississippi Before and After Hurricane Katrina ....................... 17
   The Mississippi Alternative Housing Program’s Role in Recovery ............................................................................................ 20

## Chapter Two: The Temporary Housing Story ........... 27
   MAHP’s Vision and Approach .......................................................... 27
   Manufacturing, Installing and Occupying the Cottages ....................... 37
   Linking Cottages and Families ........................................................... 39

## Chapter Three: Transitioning to Permanent Housing ......................................................... 49
   Disposition Planning and Challenges ................................................ 50
   The Disposition Plan ............................................................................ 53
   Progress on Special Projects and Disposition Activities .................... 63

## Chapter Four: Preliminary Results of the Building Sciences Evaluation .......................................................... 67
   Introduction ........................................................................................... 67
   Procurement and Manufacturing ......................................................... 70
   Development of Accessible (UFAS) Units ........................................... 71
   Site Development and Installation ....................................................... 71
   Ventilation and Air Quality Testing .................................................... 73
   Durability ............................................................................................... 73
Chapter Five: Observations and Lessons Learned.....77
How viable and livable are the MAHP units and how did they affect quality of life for those who lived in them?...............................77
How did the grantee’s approach and capacity affect implementation and outcomes?.................................................................81
How did community stakeholders react to MAHP and to what extent did community response affect program implementation?...................................................................................83

Endnotes ........................................................................................................87

Attachment 1
Jurisdiction Maps Showing Distribution of MAHP Units ..........................................................89

Attachment 2
Program Goals from the MAHP Performance Management Plan .....................................................105

Attachment 3
Example Memorandum of Understanding ..........107
List of Exhibits

Exhibit 1-1: Biloxi, Mississippi: A Biloxi beach after Katrina on September 3, 2005 .................................................................17
Exhibit 1-2: Damage from Hurricane Katrina .................................................................18
Exhibit 1-3: MAHP’s Geographical Coverage .................................................................19
Exhibit 1-4: Damaged Rental Units .................................................................................20
Exhibit 1-5: Park Model Exterior and Floor Plan .............................................................21
Exhibit 1-6: The Mississippi Cottage ..............................................................................22
Exhibit 1-7: Typical Park Model and Mississippi Cottage Interiors ...............................23
Exhibit 1-8: The Eco Cottage .........................................................................................24
Exhibit 1-9: Number of MAHP Units Occupied by Month June 2007 to August 2008 ........................................................................24
Exhibit 1-10: The Distribution of Occupied MAHP Units Over the Program’s Six-County Geography ........................................................................25
Exhibit 2-1: MAHP’s Operational Sites ...........................................................................29
Exhibit 2-2: MAHP Organizational Chart – First Quarter ..............................................31
Exhibit 2-3: Many Local Governments are Still Operating Out of Temporary Trailers ...........................................................................32
Exhibit 2-4: Housing Characteristics Along the Gulf Coast .............................................34
Exhibit 2-5: Advisory Base Flood Elevations and the National Flood Insurance Program ...........................................................................36
Exhibit 2-6: Aerial View of MAHP Transition Site Near Gulfport, MS.........................38
Exhibit 2-7: Initial “Right-Sizing” Criteria .......................................................................42
Exhibit 2-8: Distribution of MAHP Household Sizes .....................................................44
Exhibit 3-1: MAHP Organizational Chart June 2008 ....................................................51
Exhibit 3-2: Elevation Requirements Vary Along the Mississippi Gulf Coast; Elevated Home in Waveland, MS; July 2008 ........................................54
Exhibit 3-3: Habitat for Humanity of Bay Waveland Worked with a Manufacturer to Design an Addition for Cottages and Park Models ........................................56
Exhibit 3-4: Draft Pricing Structure for Cottages ............................................................59
Exhibit 3-5: A Cottage in a Mobile Home park in Gautier, July 2008 ................................................................. 63

Exhibit 4-1: Number of Units Produced by Each Manufacturer and Production Site. ................................................................. 71