

Developing A More Viable Disaster Housing Unit: A Case Study of the Mississippi Alternative Housing Program



February 2, 2009

Prepared by:
Abt Associates Inc.
Amy Jones & Associates

Prepared for:
Department of Housing and Urban Development
Office of Policy Development & Research

Federal Emergency Management Agency
Disaster Assistance Directorate
Alternative Housing Pilot Program

Acknowledgements

This report was prepared by Abt Associates Inc. for the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) and the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development's (HUD) Office of Policy Development and Research (PD&R). FEMA established an interagency agreement with HUD to evaluate the Alternative Housing Pilot Program (AHPP). This case study is the first in a series of evaluation reports and reviews the State of Mississippi's AHPP program from grant start-up in 2007 through August 2008.

The primary authors of this case study are Amy Jones of Amy Jones Associates, Inc. and Erin Wilson of Abt Associates. Dana Bres of PD&R authored Chapter Four, which reviews and summarizes the building sciences evaluation in Mississippi. Larry Buron and Jill Khadduri of Abt Associates provided technical review. The authors are appreciative of the guidance and support provided by Cheryl Levine at HUD and Naomi Johnson at FEMA.

This case study would not have been possible without the willingness of the Mississippi Emergency Management Agency (MEMA) to allow the evaluators access to the inner workings of the Mississippi Alternative Housing Program (MAHP). MEMA's leadership fostered an open, honest atmosphere that encouraged staff with varying project roles to reflect openly on the challenges, successes and lessons learned. In particular, we thank Mike Womack, MEMA's Executive Director, and the MAHP project directors, Becky Baum (MEMA), Keith Campbell (MEMA) and Debbie Norton (PBS&J) for giving generously of their time and experience. The authors also appreciate MEMA's fastidious effort to document program activities and outcomes in order to inform future disaster housing programs.

In addition to MAHP staff, many community leaders and representatives provided valuable context and important perspectives about community needs and the role MAHP is playing in recovery efforts. They gave freely of their time and opinions, despite the heavy demands of the rebuilding effort that continue three years after the storms. Lastly, we thank the MAHP program participants who shared their experiences and thoughts about the program in hopes of contributing to the development of a housing solution that will benefit families in future disasters.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

Executive Summary	1
Introduction	1
Grantee Organization	2
MAHP Program Design	3
Unit Design, Production and Installation	4
Disposition and Demobilization of Units	6
Observations and Lessons Learned	8
The MAHP Units	8
Quality of Life	11
Community Response	13
Organizational Capacity and Implementation	14
Chapter One: Introduction	17
South Mississippi Before and After Hurricane Katrina	17
The Mississippi Alternative Housing Program’s Role in Recovery	20
Chapter Two: The Temporary Housing Story	27
MAHP’s Vision and Approach	27
Manufacturing, Installing and Occupying the Cottages	37
Linking Cottages and Families	39
Chapter Three: Transitioning to Permanent Housing	49
Disposition Planning and Challenges	50
The Disposition Plan	53
Progress on Special Projects and Disposition Activities	63
Chapter Four: Preliminary Results of the Building Sciences Evaluation	67
Introduction	67
Procurement and Manufacturing	70
Development of Accessible (UFAS) Units	71
Site Development and Installation	71
Ventilation and Air Quality Testing	73
Durability	73

Chapter Five: Observations and Lessons Learned.....77

 How viable and livable are the MAHP units and how did they affect quality of life for those who lived in them?.....77

 How did the grantee's approach and capacity affect implementation and outcomes?81

 How did community stakeholders react to MAHP and to what extent did community response affect program implementation?.....83

Endnotes87

Attachment 1

Jurisdiction Maps Showing Distribution of MAHP Units89

Attachment 2

Program Goals from the MAHP Performance Management Plan 105

Attachment 3

Example Memorandum of Understanding..... 107

List of Exhibits

Exhibit 1-1: Biloxi, Mississippi: A Biloxi beach after Katrina on September 3, 2005.	17
Exhibit 1-2: Damage from Hurricane Katrina	18
Exhibit 1-3: MAHP’s Geographical Coverage	19
Exhibit 1-4: Damaged Rental Units.	20
Exhibit 1-5: Park Model Exterior and Floor Plan.....	21
Exhibit 1-6: The Mississippi Cottage.....	22
Exhibit 1-7: Typical Park Model and Mississippi Cottage Interiors	23
Exhibit 1-8: The Eco Cottage.....	24
Exhibit 1-9: Number of MAHP Units Occupied by Month June 2007 to August 2008.....	24
Exhibit 1-10: The Distribution of Occupied MAHP Units Over the Program’s Six-County Geography	25
Exhibit 2-1: MAHP’s Operational Sites.....	29
Exhibit 2-2: MAHP Organizational Chart – First Quarter	31
Exhibit 2-3: Many Local Governments are Still Operating Out of Temporary Trailers	32
Exhibit 2-4: Housing Characteristics Along the Gulf Coast.....	34
Exhibit 2-5: Advisory Base Flood Elevations and the National Flood Insurance Program	36
Exhibit 2-6: Aerial View of MAHP Transition Site Near Gulfport, MS... 38	
Exhibit 2-7: Initial “Right-Sizing” Criteria	42
Exhibit 2-8: Distribution of MAHP Household Sizes	44
Exhibit 3-1: MAHP Organizational Chart June 2008	51
Exhibit 3-2: Elevation Requirements Vary Along the Mississippi Gulf Coast; Elevated Home in Waveland, MS; July 2008.....	54
Exhibit 3-3: Habitat for Humanity of Bay Waveland Worked with a Manufacturer to Design an Addition for Cottages and Park Models.....	56
Exhibit 3-4: Draft Pricing Structure for Cottages.....	59

Exhibit 3-5: A Cottage in a Mobile Home park in Gautier,
July 200863

Exhibit 4-1: Number of Units Produced by Each Manufacturer and
Production Site.71